



TANZANIA PLANTATION AND AGRICULTURAL WORKERS UNION (TPAWU)

ACTION RESEARCH REPORT:

FACTORS AFFECTING LABOR CONDITIONS IN HORTICULTURE INDUSTRY IN TANZANIA

CONDUCTED BY:
TPAWU
P.O BOX 77420
AGGREY/SIKUKUU STREET
DAR ES SALAAM - TANZANIA
E-Mail: tpawu@africaonline.co.tz
FEBRUARY 2011



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Tanzania Plantation and Agricultural Workers Union (TPAWU) wishes to express their thanks to Mr. Beda Ngalapa (Consultant) for his guidance on the study and Ms. Phillipina Mosha, Anna Karumuna and Mary Mwezimpya for facilitating the study.

We also recognize the contribution of all those who devoted their time providing required information and provide support in many aspects. These include; workers (women and men), trade union leadership and management of Kiliflora (Nduruma and Loliondo), Hortanzia, Mount Meru Flowers, Enza Zaden Tanzania Africa, Fides, Q-sem, Dekker Bruins, Kilihotex, Arusha Blooms, Kiliflair, Multi-Flowers and Tanzania Flowers.

Particular thanks are extended to other people who freely volunteered their time to provide information for the study including officials of the Arusha Regional Commissioners office. Special thanks are extended to the Tanzania Horticultural Association (TAHA), Occupational Safety and Health Commission (OSHA), Labor institutions in Arusha and the Trade Union Congress of Tanzania (TUCTA) for their support.

In particular we also wish to thank the Project Manager Ms Rachel English for her valuable comments and guidance for the study. We may not mention everybody for support but we say thank you very much.

The views in this study are entirely of the researchers.

KABENGWE NDEBILE KABENGWE
GENERAL SECRETARY
TPAWU



C O N T E N T S

	Page
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>i</i>
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	<i>iv</i>
<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>Executive Summary</i>	<i>vi</i>
CHAPTER ONE:	1
1.1 Methodological Issues for the Study.....	1
1.2 Methods and Tools for the Research	4
1.3 Circumstances During the Study.....	6
CHAPTER TWO	7
2.0 Horticulture Industry in Tanzania and its Challenges.....	7
2.1 Horticulture Production and Economic Impact	7
2.2 Ownership.....	7
2.3 Outstanding Labor Rights Issues	9
2.4 Some Challenges	10
2.5 Effects of Global Economic Crisis.....	11
2.6 Future Scenario of Horticulture Industry.....	12
CHAPTER THREE	13
3.0 Study Findings.....	13
3.1 Purchasing Practices and Impact on Labor Rights	13
3.2 External Factors Causing Gendered Occupational Segregation Within the cut Flower Industry.....	25
3.3 Effectiveness of Social Codes of Practice on Gender.....	40
CHAPTER FOUR	53
4.0 Conclusions and Recommendations.....	53
4.1 Purchasing Practices of European Retailers and Impact on Workers....	53
4.2 Cultural, Behavioral and Management Influences.....	55
4.3 Effectiveness of Social Codes of Practice Regarding Gender Issues.....	57
REFERENCES	59
APPENDIX	60



ABBREVIATIONS

CBA:	Collective Bargaining Agreements
CEO:	Chief Executive Officer
ICC:	International Codes of Conduct
ICT:	Information Communication and Technology
FLO:	Fair Trade Labeling Organization
HODET:	Horticulture Development of Tanzania
ILO:	International Labor Organization
JB:	Joint Body
JKIA:	Jomo Kenyata International Airport
KIA:	Kilimanjaro International Airport
KWDF:	Kiliflora Workers Development Fund
MD:	Managing Director
NFFPFATU:	Agriculture Trade Union of Ethiopia
OSHA:	Occupational Safety and Health
PPE:	Personal Protective Equipment
SACCOS:	Savings and Credit Cooperative Society
TAHA:	Tanzania Horticulture Association
TPAWU:	Tanzania Plantation and Agricultural Workers Union
UWEA:	Uganda Workers Education Association
WWC:	Women Workers Committee
WWW:	Women Working Worldwide



LIST OF TABLES

1. Number of respondents by gender
2. Ownership, size and products of farms
3. Number of buyers for each farm and percentage
4. Minimum monthly wage for workers and their concerns
5. Managerial position and holders by gender
6. Women and Men in Managerial position
7. Code compliance certification and auditing
8. Comparisons on code compliance between farms
9. Farm compliance and indicators
10. Progress made: Freedom of Association and Collective Bargaining 2005-2009



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Action Research on Factors Affecting Labor Conditions in the Horticulture Sector in Tanzania was conducted by Tanzania Plantation and Agricultural Workers Union (TPAWU) from November 2008 to December 2009. The study was commissioned as part of the project 'Developing Strategies for Change for Women in African Horticulture'. The three year project, which commenced in 2008, was implemented by TPAWU in the horticulture sector in Tanzania. The aim of the project is to improve the lives of the women workers in horticulture farms by implementing strategies that will enable them to claim their rights as workers.

Three components of the project include; training for workers on labor and women's rights, research to document the factors affecting labor conditions and the findings of the research are intended to shape advocacy campaign to address workers concerns.

The project was funded by COMIC RELIEF through Women Working Worldwide (WWW)¹. Other partner organizations implementing similar projects are; Uganda Workers Education Association (UWEA) and Agriculture Trade Union of Ethiopia (NFFPFATU).

The project findings are intended to help women who are the majority workforce in the horticulture sector in Tanzania to be empowered and improve their lives. The women lack experience of labor rights and social security in the workplace.

This research report presents factors affecting labor conditions; the focus was specifically on three main themes;

- The Purchasing Practices of the European Retailers. The aim was to

¹ WWW is UK based organization that works with an international network of NGO and trade unions supporting women workers. The focus is on the situation of workers in industries supplying the world market with consumer goods. It is a registered charity governed by a Board of Trustees.



gather information on the impact of the production system on workers, specifically the buying practices of the European supermarkets, wholesalers/agents and local suppliers.

- Cultural, behavioral and management influences; to make an assessment of the influence external to the supply chain that are causing gender specific issues such as sexual division of labor, inability to manage domestic roles and workplace abuse;
- The effectiveness of Codes of Practice primarily regarding gender issues. This intended to gather information on the efficacy of the Social Codes of Practice operating on the farms and perceived achievements of these codes and outstanding issues in addressing gender concerns.

Twelve (12) horticulture farms and 240 respondents were selected for the study. The study used both qualitative and quantitative approach to data collection, the most dominant methods included; documentary analysis, observations, interviews, workshops and focus group discussions (with women and men workers, TPAWU and women workers committees at branch level, including farm supervisors and managers). Most of these methods were useful in terms of generating relevant information required by the study. The findings of the research were verified by the respondents through a feedback workshop, which was organized for that purpose.



SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Purchasing Practices of European Retailers and Impact on Workers

Findings

The study has revealed linkages between purchasing practices and labor rights issues. For example:

- About 50 percent of the respondents indicated that their orders are variable and as a result producers lack stability and have surplus produce for which they gain low prices or wasted products;
- 41 percent of the respondents said that customers change volume and other criteria of orders at short notice and majority of farm managers are unable to refuse these changes. As a result they ask workers to work overtime;
- 40 percent of the respondents said their customers place high orders with a short turn around time for delivery, in order to ensure the order is completed on time producers ask workers to work overtime or recruit more workers;
- 40 percent of the respondents said their customers make late payment and as a result the cash flow is disturbed and producers are unable to pay workers on time;
- Sometimes customers ask producers to pay a contribution towards their overhead costs based on sales volume. (For example, auction commission and communication which is calculated in percentages);
- About 50 percent of the respondents indicated that their customers fine producers for failure to deliver in full by paying a low price or rejecting the product. This causes loss of projected income, as a result producers fail to pay workers effectively;
- 75 percent of the respondents revealed that quality specification and production costs have increased in the past 5 years but the price of the product has not increased. This will affect the income of the producers; As a result of the above situation producers are unable to pay better



wages and provide for better facilities to the workers leading to indecent jobs, employment insecurity and sometimes working for long hours, however, extra hours do not exceed legal working time. Because of job insecurity some workers are unable to organize into trade unions and negotiate with employers for better working conditions.

Working for long hours mean they work for more than 8 hours a day. Although extra hours are paid for but the fact remains that they have worked for long hours. Sometimes they are exhausted but have to work extra hours although not by force. Working for long hours is not illegal as long as the extra hours does not exceed 3 hours per day or 12 hours per week and the extra hours worked is paid accordingly and workers are not forced. Working extra hours is a concern to all workers, but more serious concern was expressed by working mothers who have triple roles to play at family and community levels. Working mothers need enough time for family chores, community roles and productive activities,

General recommendations

- Actions should be taken to regulate the purchasing practices to avoid unnecessary complications and ensure consistency of orders, contracts with customers with agreeable terms, stick to agreed volume or other criteria of orders, adequate notice period, sufficient lead time, comply with legal overtime, avoid cancellation of orders, prompt payment, information about demand trends, avoid payment of contribution, avoid fining producers, avoid deductions without agreement with producers and ensure producers sell at profitable prices.
- Ensure customers understand the full costs of production and include labor and social costs issues when calculating a minimum selling price per unit. For example, minimum wages, overtime, social benefits for workers, job training costs, health and safety, recruitment costs, occupational health and safety equipment costs.
- Advocacy actions are necessary and this could be taken at national,



regional and international levels by human and labor rights advocates.

Cultural, Behavioral and Management Influences on Workers

Findings

In a sample study over 60% of the workers are women. It was learnt that the wrong image attitude and perceptions by farm supervisors and the local managers on women workers stems out of socialization processes on responsibilities of women and men as dictated by customs, traditions, habits, religion all aggravated in cultural practices;

Some of the cultural biases are uncritically accepted by women workers themselves due to low awareness and education;

Cultural practices often create barriers preventing women workers from taking precautions against gender discrimination and violation perpetrated against them at the expense of other rights.

- Cultural practices are explicit in gender roles, decision making and leadership, access and control of resources, and legal issues. Gender roles are image attitudes and perceptions stemming out of the socialization process on activities/responsibilities of women and men in society. These are influenced by culture, level of the economy, religion and age. For example, with regard to roles, women are mostly assigned the reproductive roles, family care and domestic chores, whereas men are mostly involved in paid productive activities, management and leadership. Women and men are both involved in productive activities, however, within the society the work and activities done by a woman are not demonstrated as tangibly as those of a man. A man has much work that is formal, high ranking with much status such as leadership as compared to a woman who performs qualitative service oriented jobs.
- Women workers take lower positions in management and therefore have



limited decision making powers. The study noted some efforts made by the government and trade union to empower women workers on their rights and address cultural practices which affect women workers, which include awareness training, creation of structures such as women workers committees and gender equality policy.

General Recommendations

- Empowerment of management on gender equality issues at the workplaces.
- Promote gender mainstreaming in the trade union and management structures;
- Trade unions and management of the farms should empower women workers on their rights and fight the negative effect of culture;
- Trade union structures including Women's committees should be strengthened to address women workers issues and concerns including fighting cultural injustices at the workplaces.

Effectiveness of Social Codes of Practice regarding gender issues:

Findings

The study analyzed the impact of the International Code of Conduct for the Cut Flower Production (ICC)² on improving working conditions. The study revealed that four (4) out of twelve (12) farms in the sample study applied the ICC and was effective to a big extent. For example;

The ICC was the only social code applicable in four farms (Nduruma, Loliondo, Hortanzia and Mount Meru Flowers). Nduruma and Loliondo were certified with Flower Labeling Organization International (FLO)³, only

2 The code aims to guarantee that flowers have been produced under socially and environmentally sustainable conditions. It provides a concise statement of minimum labour, human rights and environmental standards for the international cut flower industry.

3 It is an international body which incorporate various stakeholders, created to improve the situation for producers. It sets standards and ensures the international regular auditing. Producers registered with FLO receive a minimum price that cover the costs of production and an extra premium that is invested in the local community ("Promoting Women Workers Rights in African Horticulture- 2005-2007")



Kiliflora was certified with and Ethical Trading Initiative (ETI) Base Code⁴.

In 8 out of 12 farms under the sample study workers (mostly women) enjoy the right to freedom of association and improved working conditions through collective bargaining agreements (CBA). Also it was learnt that there is equal treatment between women and men, in most cases workers work legal working hours and majority (about 60%) have legal contracts of employment. In the rest of farms (4) respondents from the management in the sample study, respondents claimed that they understand the importance of the code of but were unable to apply them fully at the farm. For example, they have no CBA and claimed they were unable to meet the required standards of the code which have cost implications especially in relation to wage increase and legal contract of employment;

- Workers in the certified farms are involved in auditing of implementation of the codes. For example workers' representatives are asked to assess the implementation of the codes, discuss with management and propose some improvement.
- Health and safety for workers is observed in majority of the farms, workers are given PPE, trained on labor issues and thus health and safety committees have been formed.
- All horticulture farms do not pay a living wage, they only pay legal minimum wage which is not enough to cover costs of the basic needs.
- The International Codes of Conduct do not adequately address maternity protection issues. Since majority of workforce in the horticulture are women, the codes should include clauses on reproductive issues and especially maternity protection.

General Recommendations

- The International Codes of Conduct (ICC) should be revised and improved to include gender sensitive issues for the women workers such as; protection on reproductive health issues, maternity protection

⁴ It is an alliance of companies, Non Governmental organizations (NGO's) and trade union organizations, which aim to promote and improve the implementation of the corporate codes of practice which cover supply chain working conditions.



and protection from sexual harassment.

- TPAWU should take advantage of the ICC to negotiate better terms and conditions of employment with employers and conclude CBA.
- Codes of conduct should not pass farms paying below a living wage.
- Government, employers, workers organizations and management should ensure workers earn a living wage.
- TPAWU and management should conduct awareness training for workers on the importance of social codes of practice.



STRUCTURE OF THE REPORT

The report is divided into four main chapters. Chapter One: presents Methodological Issues of the Study, Chapter Two: is on Historical Information and Challenges facing the Horticulture industry in Tanzania. Chapter Three: presents Study Findings and Analysis, which is divided into three sections. Section One is on Purchasing Practices of the European Market and Impact on Workers, Section Two on Social Codes of Practice, particularly regarding gender issues and Section Three on Cultural Influences and Management Practices. Chapter Four: presents some conclusions and recommendations.



CHAPTER ONE

1.1 METHODOLOGICAL ISSUES FOR THE STUDY

1.1.1 Aims of the study

The study was conducted by TPAWU with the support of Mr. Beda Ngalapa (Consultant). It is a key activity in the project “Developing Strategies for Change for Women in African Horticulture”, which is a three years project implemented by TPAWU. The project is implemented in partnership with Uganda Workers Education Association (UWEA) and Agriculture Trade Union of Ethiopia (NFFPFATU). It commenced in April 2008, in the horticulture sector in Tanzania. It is funded by Comic Relief under the coordination of “Women working worldwide” (WWW)⁵.

The aim of the project is to improve the lives of the women workers in horticulture farms by implementing strategies that will enable them to claim their rights as workers. The project is intended to empower and assist women who make up the majority (over 60%) of the workforce in the horticultural sector in Tanzania, many of these farms supply to the European markets. The majority of these women lack awareness of labor rights and social security in their workplaces.

The project tackles the causes of the labor rights problems and its activities are based on three components, these are; training for workers on labor and women’s rights, research to document the factors affecting labor conditions, the findings of which are intended to shape an advocacy campaign to address workers concerns.

The main purpose of the research was to establish evidence as a base study in

⁵ WWW is a UK based organization that works with an international network of NGO and trade unions supporting women workers. The focus is on the situation of workers in industries supplying the European market with consumer goods. It is a registered charity managed by a Board of Trustees.



order to monitor improvement of their lives and give women workers a voice to defend their rights. Specific issues for the research were to:

Purchasing Practices of European Retailers and Impact on Workers

The main purpose was to understand the impact of the purchasing practices by European supermarkets, wholesalers, agents and local suppliers on workers in the horticulture farms in Tanzania. The study concentrated on specific issues as follows; (i) stability of relationships, (ii), flexibility and seasonality, (iii) conditions for delivery, (iv) payment to the customer, (v) quality and (vi) price of the products.

Cultural, Behavioral and Management Influences on Workers:

On this issue the study aimed to make an assessment of the social influences external to the supply chain that are causing gender specific issues such as sexual division of labor, inability to manage domestic roles, and workplace abuse and discrimination. Specific issues for the research were on; attitudes of management towards women workers and specifically reproductive mothers, company experiences on the employment of women and efforts made to empower women workers to address their needs and concerns.

Effectiveness of Social Codes of Practice, primarily regarding gender issues:

The main purpose was to understand the effectiveness of the Social Codes of Practice operating on the farms, perceived achievements of these codes and outstanding issues regarding gender.

1.1.2 Research Area and Sampling

1.1.2.1 Research area

The study was conducted from September 2008 to June 2009 in Arusha and Kilimanjaro Regions which are among 26 administrative regions of Tanzania. The regions are located in the Northern part of Tanzania at the southern foot of Mountain Meru and Kilimanjaro. The horticulture farms



are found in two districts of Arusha and Meru in the region. The climatic condition of the area is suitable for the horticulture production.

The map of Tanzania showing the area of study (Arusha)



1.1.2.2 Sampling of research respondents

A sample of 12 horticulture farms (10 cut-flower and 2 vegetable / seed) out of 21 farms operating in Tanzania was selected. These were; Tanzania Flowers Limited, Mount Meru Flowers Limited, Dekker Bruins (Kilimanjaro) Limited, Hortanzia Farms Limited, Dekker Bruins (Tanzania), Dekker Breeding Limited, Kiliflora Limited, Fides Tanzania Limited, Q-Sem Tanzania Limited, Arusha Blooms Limited and Kilihotex and Serengeti Fresh.



1.1.2.3 Number of respondents

A sample of 240 respondents was purposefully selected and these include; women and men workers employed in the farms and TPAWU branch officials including branch committee members and women workers committee (WWC) members. Other respondents of the study were from Tanzania Horticulture Association (TAHA) Labor institutions and Arusha Regional authority. The number of respondents for the study is as indicated in the table below:

Table 1: Number of respondents by gender

Type of respondent	Women	Men	Total
Workers (in 12 horticulture farms) Tanzania Flowers, Mount Meru Flowers, Dekker Bruins (Kilimanjaro), Enza Zaden, Hortanzia, Dekker Bruins (Tanzania) and Dekker Breeding. Others were; Kiliflora (Loliondo and Nduruma), Fides, Q-Sem, Arusha Blooms and Kilihotex.	104	53	157
TPAWU (branch Chairmen, Secretaries, Women Workers Committee Chairpersons, Secretaries, Area Secretary, Zonal Chairperson, Zonal Women Chairperson and Zonal Secretary)	27	21	48
Management(Executive Director, Human Resource Managers, Assistant Human Resource Manager, Supervisors).	5	9	14
Others (TAHA, Labor institutions, Regional Commissioner)	10	12	22
Total	146	95	241

Respondents were a mix of different educational background, age groups, marital status, ethnic groups, work experiences, work category and, position and work experiences. Majority (69%) of the respondents come from Arusha region and others from Kilimanjaro, Mbeya, Mwanza, Shinyanga, Tabora, Singida, Tanga and Dodoma. The respondents represent six ethnic groups, these include; Sukuma, Pare, Maasai, Chaga, Nyamwezi and Nyakyusa.

1.2 Methods and tools for the research

Methods and tools were adopted to acquire information, arrange data, aggregation and conduct analysis. Six research tools included review of official documentation, interviews, workshops, focus group discussions, and observation.



The study used both qualitative and quantitative approach. This was employed to seek personal opinions, attitudes, values, feelings and perceptions from respondents within their environment.

1.2.1 Document analysis

A review of literature was conducted to understand what other researchers have said about relevant issues for the study. Basic documents on employment issues of horticulture workers were studied including files and earlier research reports on women in the horticulture sector in Tanzania

Interviews with workers and management provided required information. Additional information on specific issues like purchasing practices was acquired through in depth interviews with farm management.

Focus group discussions conducted during research workshops: More qualitative and quantitative information were generated through focus group discussions, which were conducted during the research workshops. Three research workshops for data collection were conducted; the findings of the research were verified by the respondents through feedback workshops which involved workers, management and labor institutions.

The first research workshop involved 39 participants from 12 horticulture farms, introduced research objectives, issues and methodology of data collection. Most of the information for the research was collected through focus group discussions. The focus group discussions consisted of a limited number of people (6-9). Each discussed the research questions and agreed on the answers, which were recorded by the researchers.

The second feedback research workshop was conducted to verify the data and get more information. During the workshop more qualitative information was obtained and the respondents included; workers and management representatives from horticulture farms, labor officials, and the Health and safety institution (OSHA), TPAWU and women workers



committee members at branch, zone and national levels. The methods used for data collection were useful in terms of generating relevant information required by the study.

The draft report and recommendations was presented and discussed during the feedback workshop with stakeholders, conducted in Arusha in July 2009. Valuable feedback was received and form part of the report.

Importance of the research

The research outcome would be useful to the workers, especially the women workers and management within the local farms covered by the project and also indirect beneficiaries. These include workers in all TPAWU sectors of tea, sisal, sugar, mixed farming, crop boards and crop authorities and also women single mothers in public and private workplaces.

1.3 Circumstances during the study

The research took place at the moment of uncertainty in relation to the global economic crisis. The performance of most horticulture farms was poor, management, TPAWU and the workers were worried about the expected negative impact of the global economic crisis on workers. Management in two farms had already planned to retrench workers and cut down costs.

The workers and TPAWU were in a tense situation, worried about possibility of losing their jobs. Despite the worrying economic circumstances workers and management responded to the research questions and provided the required information and this is highly appreciated.

The views of some respondents in the study have not been named in order to protect their jobs and positions. Data obtained from three themes of the study revealed varying but interdependent scenarios on the findings. We henceforth outline them in separate sections in Chapter Three.



CHAPTER TWO

2.0 HORTICULTURE INDUSTRY IN TANZANIA AND ITS CHALLENGES

2.1 Horticulture production and economic impact

Horticulture is a non-traditional crop in Tanzania; it offers good opportunities for employment especially for women, who make up approximately 60% of the workforce.

The actual horticulture production industry is mostly confined in Arusha and Kilimanjaro regions. The industry has experienced tremendous growth since its inception in 1987 with the establishment of the Tanzania Flowers Limited (TFL). From 1992 the industry has grown from 6000 sq. m to more than 208 hectares growing various products. The sector is gaining economic importance. The production, distribution and consumption of horticultural produce increased tremendously from 0.89 billion tons to 1.3 billion tons.

Products for export include cut-flower, (mostly roses), flower cuttings (chrysanthemum) and vegetable seeds. We are further informed that roses are the dominant export flowers produced and exported from Tanzania, where more than ten different varieties are said to be produced contributing to more than 70 % of the total cut-flower production.

2.2 Ownership

Horticulture Development of Tanzania (HODET) and Tanzania Horticulture Association (TAHA) are two organizations pioneering the growth of the industry in the country.

- Horticulture is the fastest agricultural sub-sector providing alternative employment to more than 10,000 people and earning the country over USD 45 million per annum;



- The industry has had a significant impact on the national income in terms of wages paid out to employees and taxes to the government;
- The industry is a source of foreign exchange as almost all the companies are paid through the banks within weeks after delivery;
- Export policies⁶ for horticulture also assist small and medium-sized local farmers by providing improved infrastructure and financial systems to facilitate farm-to-market movement and increase funding for research and extension services.

The majority of Tanzanian horticulture farms are fully or partially owned by foreign farmers and seeders as indicated in Table 2 hereunder. Information on ownership, size, and age of the farm, products for export is as presented below:

Table 2: Ownership, Size, Age and Products of Farms

	FARM NAME	OWNERSHIP	HECTARS	YEAR of establishment	PRODUCTS
1.	Tanzania Flowers Ltd.	Holland (Bastian Bruins)	21	1980	Cut Flower Roses
2.	Mount Meru Flowers	Austria (Herwiq Tretter)	15	1998	Cut Flower Roses
3.	Dekker Bruins Kilimanjaro	Holland (Dekker & Bruins Family)	18	2001	Flower cuttings
4.	Tanzania Flowers –Dolly	Holland (Bastian Bruins)	15	2006	Cut Flower Roses
5.	Hortanzia Ltd.	Greece (H.G. Combos)	10	1993	Cut Flower Roses
6.	Dekker Bruins (T)	Holland- (Dekker & Bruins Family)	18	1998	Flower cuttings (Chrysanthemum)
7.	Dekker Breeding	Holland- (Dekker & Bruins Family)	0.334	2003	Cuttings
8.	Kiliflora (Nduruma)	Share Holders	53	1993	--Cut Flower Roses --Fillers --Flower Nursery



9.	Kiliflora (Loliondo)	China, England and Holland(Share holders)	53	1993	--Cut Flower Roses --Fillers --Flower Nursery
10.	Fides Tanzania Ltd.	Holland (Private)	8	2005	Flower cutting
11.	Q-SEM Ltd.	Belgium (Private)	8	2002	--Vegetable seeds (cucumber, tomato and pepper)
12.	Arusha Blooms	Tanzania(Share Holders)	15	1996	--Cut Flower Roses

Source: *Field Research Data (2009)*

In the labor market however, the era of global integration and flexibility is termed as one of generalized precariousness and vulnerability leading to indecent jobs with increasingly insecure forms of work and declining permanent terms of employment. The industry's integration into European supply chains and deregulation of export markets leads to precariousness of the farmers' profits affecting workers' status, especially women workers (WW) who are the majority consisting of more than 60% of total horticulture workforce in Tanzania.

2.3 Outstanding labor rights issues

Despite the revision of the Labor Legislation in practice some employers have not fully complied, for example provision of legal contracts of employment. Local producers have reduced the number of workers and others closed up their business. Employers attribute this to continued economic hardships due to poor income and as a result:

- Some workers are engaged for long hours, often in hard conditions with little, inadequate or 'conditional pay' as cheap laborers;
- Approximately 30% of non-permanent workers have neither labor contracts, ability to organize nor rights to social services or sickness, insurance and holidays;



- Most use their meager earnings to pay school fees, but the bulk to buy cheap non nutritive food for mere survival.

Consequently, there have been prolonged debates on the most effective approaches and strategies to assist horticulture women workers promote their rights. The strategists referred to are, for example forcing employers to comply with requirements of the Labor Legislation which provides for workers rights. Some horticulture producers might not be ready to comply with labor requirement which provides for workers rights. This is due to various reasons including avoiding labor costs such as maternity leave costs, medical, leave etc.

Despite the strategies employed there have been violations of workers and trade union rights. There are some evidences where trade union leaders have been harassed and some lost their jobs in the process of fighting for workers rights. Experience also shows that in some workplaces workers hesitate to join the union and contest for union leadership in fear of harassment or losing their jobs.

2.4 Some Challenges

Tanzania has a significant comparative advantage in the production and export of high value horticultural products, based on location, agro-climatic conditions, availability of land and water, and market access that include counter-seasonal production. The horticultural sector should be able to translate that comparative advantage into competitive advantage at the individual farm and agribusiness firm level. The larger grower-exporters, who are normally relatively sophisticated in production and marketing, in order to increase their output, are usually increasingly willing to help extend their knowledge to smaller-scale growers.

These opportunities should neither be left go nor get lost due to the fact that the horticulture industry and crops, becoming increasingly firm, are more valuable than other crops and use less water per volume and value of



production. The competitive advantages of production and sales may not be reached and maintained without explicit efforts to do so.

2.5 Effects of Global Economic Crisis

The industry is no longer yielding the anticipated fortune even during the peak flower consumption times like Valentine's Day, Mothers' Day and the Easter holidays as the industry is undergoing a deepening serious economic crisis since September 2008, when the whole world is being confronted with a financial meltdown.

The global credit crunch continues to bite horticultural exports which are getting more expensive to ship and even harder to sell while production costs continue hitting the greenhouse roofs.

There are certain factors which have put overbearing pressure on the demand and sales prices of flowers and vegetables in the market. From October 2008, prices on average have declined by between 30 and 50 % as compared to the previous year, while certain varieties and lengths of flowers have had zero demand in European markets.

The impact of reduced credit, higher unemployment, erosion of personal savings and investments has all seriously reduced the demand of flowers from Tanzania, more so in emerging markets.

A major growth in the world economy by 5.2 % in 2007 saw a marked growth in the flower industry with increased supply that exceeded demand, a situation leading to a downfall of prices.

Two major importers of East African flowers have seen their currencies weakened drastically leading to curtailed imports of flowers. The UK Pound has weakened by 28 % in last year (2008) alone resulting in a 20 % reduction of East African imports and Russian Rouble by 35 % which has had the equivalent downward impact on Russian prices.



This has had a devastating effect on the financial credibility of local farmers to continue producing to past levels or having reliable markets in and outside the country.

Another contributing factor is the European weather, which has been very severe in most European countries during the past winter, worst since 1997 with temperatures falling as low as minus 30 degrees, impacting on delivery and distribution of fresh flowers. Outdoor and florist sales have been the most affected, as consumers reduced consumption of fresh produce curtailing their purchases. Wholesalers and distributors have suffered machinery breakdowns and delivery cancellations due to impassable roads negatively effecting imports and seriously reducing prices of whatever little that is being sold. (Mkindi;TAHA 2009)

2.6 Future Scenario of Horticulture Industry

The future scenarios in horticulture production in the country should take note of the aforementioned impact of the global financial crisis on the industry. They should therefore, work with larger horticulture industry and produce maximum fresh exports, food processing, and look for domestic markets. Also establish stronger linkages with various support and service industries.



CHAPTER THREE

3.0 STUDY FINDINGS

3.1 Purchasing practices and impact on labour rights

Information on purchasing practices was gathered from 12 horticulture farm management. These included Directors, Managers and supervisors who were conversant with purchasing practices of the company. The workers of different categories, age, and gender and education background were part of the respondents and provided their inputs during research and feedback workshops.

About 84% of the twelve horticulture farms surveyed are owned by foreign investors, the rest are jointly owned between local and foreign investors and only two farms are owned by residents. The farms vary in size; the smallest is less than 1 hectare and the largest are 53 hectares. About 50% of the horticulture farms were established during early 1990s and the rest in 2000s. For the past 20 years Tanzania has been exporting horticulture products to the European markets.

The aim of looking into the international purchasing mechanisms of the global value chains and channels is to investigate whether a link exists between purchasing practices and labor rights issues on the production farms.

The study needed to gather information on the impact of buying practices by European supermarkets, wholesalers/agents (supplying to both retail and auction markets) with special reference to women workers. The main focus is to build evidence on various issues including the effect of cumulative pressure from international buyers, decision making processes and its effects on the production process and its subsequent effects on



workers and particularly women workers.

The findings would help TPAWU to build evidence for campaigning in Europe around the negative effects of purchasing practices on producers and workers. Also it would be used to develop recommendations for change that would improve management ability to look after workers. A further purpose was to build a relationship with farm management and give them a voice and enable them to take concerns directly to buyers if requested by the management concerned.

Within this context then and in order to bring the evidence more closely to the problems suffered by the concerned management and their workforce, but particularly women workers, we adopted six key research issues as follows: *Stability of relationships; Flexibility and seasonality; Delivery; Payment to the customers; Quality; and Price.*

3.1.1 Stability of relationship with buyers

i. Number of buyers

The number of buyers of the horticulture products and the percentage of total output taken by each buyer varies from farm to farm. Some farms like; Q-Sem, Enza Zaden, Arusha Blooms and Dekker Bruins have one buyer who purchase products at 100%. Kiliflair has two buyers. Farms with many buyers are Mount Meru Flowers with 15 buyers and Multi-flowers with 50 buyers.

**Table 3: The number of buyers for each farm and percentage**

	Name of the farm	Number of buyers	% of products each buyer take
1.	Tanzania Flowers Ltd.	3	30%
2.	Mount Meru Flowers	15	5 -15%
3.	Dekker Bruins Kilimanjaro	1	100%
4.	Tanzania Flowers –Dolly	3	30%
5.	Hortanzia Ltd.	11	10 -20%
6.	Dekker Bruins (T)	1	100%
7.	Enza Zaden Africa	1	100%
8.	Kiliflora (Nduruma)	7	Depends
9.	Kiliflora (Loliondo)	7	Depends
10.	Fides Tanzania Ltd.	1	100%
11.	Q-SEM Ltd.	1	100%
12.	Arusha Brooms	1	100%

Source: TPAWU Field Research 2009

ii. Relationships with customers

The majorities (9) have long standing relationships with the majority of their customers and 3 have long standing relationships with about half of their customers, these are Serengeti Fresh, Tanzania Flowers and Arusha Blooms.

Two farms, Kiliflora and Hortanzia, sell to direct market in Switzerland, Germany, Norway and Holland. The farms are certified (Fair Trade Labeling Organization). Enza Zaden and Q-Sem export direct to their mother companies in the Netherlands while Tanzania Flowers and Arusha Blooms send their products through the intermediaries. According to respondents the selling modalities have advantages and disadvantages to the producers. The advantages of selling to direct market are lower selling costs and high returns, long contracts to supply at an average price and no low season allowing the farm to meet its obligations. The disadvantage is that you cannot change the price and it is too demanding in terms of quality standards.

iii. Consistence and variability of orders

About half of the respondents indicated that their orders are consistent, these were; Kiliflair, Q-Sem, Mult-flower, Enza Zaden and Kiliflora. Farms



with variable orders were; Hortanzia, Mount Meru Flowers, Arusha Blooms and Dekker Bruins.

iv. Problems faced as a result of variability of orders

Respondents said as a result of variability of orders there is lack of stability, also the products are wasted / dumped, overgrowing and selling at a very low price, which cause losses. In this situation, farms claim that they can have problems meeting running costs including paying salaries those of labor. Also farms cannot afford better wages and other benefits for the workers.

v. Contracts with major customers

About 84% of the farms have contracts with their major customers. Farms with no contracts with customers are Tanzania Flowers Ltd and Arusha Blooms. Both farms' spokespersons said they would like to have contracts with their customers in order to be on the safe side and assured of a market for their products.

vi. Suggestions on terms of contract

For the contracts to be of maximum benefit, respondents suggested the terms to include principles of the International Labor standards and fair trade principles. The respondents suggested having a defined contract period of not less than one year. In relation to supply and payment, suggested to have a consistent supply with a fixed and timely payment to avoid losses.

The issue of transparency was very much encouraged and the importance of observing fair play in the conduct of the business and this was thought to be possible with involvement of the Tanzania lawyers during the formulation of the contracts terms. For farms with contracts they thought the issues of 'fair play' and treatment of the workers in the conduct of the business were missing in their contracts, they were of the opinion that if the issues are added the contracts could be of much benefit to producers.



3.1.2 Flexibility and seasonality

This aimed to know if there are changes in volume and other criteria, notification, lead times, overtime issues, behavior of customers, price and payment;

i. Changes in volume

It was revealed those five horticulture farms (41%) out of twelve experienced customers changing of volume and other criteria of orders after placing an order. These were; Hortanzia, Mount Meru Flowers, Arusha Blooms, Serengeti Fresh and Dekker Bruins. The experience was very discouraging in some farms, for example Arusha Blooms spokesperson said that they experienced a last minute cancellation after packing the products for export. The situation forced them to look for local sale at a very low price.

ii. Notice for an order

It was indicated that customers give notice for an order; the period of notice differs from farm to farm. According to the respondents the shortest notice is one day to one week (e.g. Dekker Bruins, Kiliflora Nduruma, Arusha Blooms and Dekker Bruins) and the longest is one month (Mount Meru Flowers and Kiliflair). Some farms, for example Q-sem receive a two weeks notice for an order.

With regard to a period of notice of changing an order, it was revealed that some customers give very short notice of one day (Kiliflora), two to three days (Serengeti Fresh and Mount Meru Flowers) and one month (Kiliflair and Q-sem). Five (respondents indicated that they are able to refuse changes to an order if it comes too late (Q-Sem, Multi-flower, Mount Meru Flowers, Arusha Blooms and Dekker Bruins).

iii. Workers' overtime

In general all farms indicated that they ask workers to work overtime for less than 10 days a month. *The legal overtime per month should not exceed 52 hours.* The study revealed that they work overtime when it becomes



necessary but this is agreed upon between workers and management and not forced. They work overtime during the high periods especially on the following occasions; around Christmas day; Easter, Mothers' day; Eid-el-Fitri; Valentine's Day; during public holidays and whenever there is big order and lot of produce. Also work overtime becomes crucial during periods of farm expansion, where workers are engaged for construction of green houses, planting and harvesting activities.

Also this happens when customers change volume or other criteria of orders after placing them. To ensure orders are completed in time producers ask workers to work overtime.

It was revealed that some employers are forced to announce overtime at the last minute because of order changes close to the deadline. As a consequence workers have to work overtime, in most cases they are paid accordingly. It was further stated that when product is plenty the management make efforts to export more and in so doing, a need for workers to work overtime arises.

Although orders are placed late, farm management still manage to keep the law in terms of overtime. Workers and management are aware of legal provisions in relation to working hours and overtime.

iv. Decrease of orders and impact on producers

It was indicated by the majority (58%) of respondents that some customers decrease their orders; the rest said they did not have such experience. For management whose customers decrease some orders, said they face damages because their products are dumped or thrown in composite manure and as a result the producer faces cash flow problems. Some respondents said they decide to sell their products locally or shift elsewhere and fetch a low price.

According to the respondents the above situation happen several times, for example; Tanzania Flowers, Arusha Blooms, and Hortanzia. For other farms



it was indicated that the problem happens during low season between June and November. Due to bad weather in consumption countries there is reduction of purchasing by customers.

v. Cancellation of orders

The study revealed that 66% of the customers cancel their orders with producers and the rest said once the customer has made orders they do not cancel. The cancellations cause the following problems to producers: loss of profit, cash flow problems, rejection of products, dumping and low price in the market. Respondents said that this happened several times (e.g. Hortanzia, Arusha Blooms and Tanzania Flowers).

"...after packing ready for export we receive a cancellation of an order, so we have to unpack by removing rubber band and re-use the product or look for local market, otherwise we dump and make local composite manure. This is a big loss because by the time of cancellation the farm has already incurred costs. As a result the farms experience big loss!"

vi. Lead times

As to when the customers place high orders with short turn around time for delivery, it was revealed by respondents that this happened during the peak season, festivals, Valentine, Mothers Day and on high season around October and December.

To ensure the orders are completed on time the respondents said they ensure they have good planning with adequate preparation including setting targets for workers, training workers and coordination, they also recruit more workers during peak season or ask workers to work overtime. Some respondents said the targets set for workers are manageable and are completed within normal working hours, in case of extra hours they are paid legal overtime. The respondents especially the women with family responsibilities expressed concerns about working overtime. Although workers needed money out of overtime bearing in mind that their wage is very low, said sometimes were



overburdened. Said they remained with little time to attend other family responsibilities. The working mothers said when they work overtime their family especially their children miss their care.

In most cases workers when asked to work overtime they do so, use their spare time to work and are compensated according to the provisions of the labor legislation. Some workers expressed that although they may want to rest and attend other family activities they postpone and remain at work for extra hours which are compensated. The union has been educating workers on working hours and rights related to overtime.

vii. Preferences of producers to receive orders

The findings indicate that some farms receive orders according to contract agreements throughout the year, others twice a month, weekly, three times a week and two times a week. Producers said they prefer to receive many orders during high production, others said weekly, after two weeks and monthly. With regard to buyer lead times, most of the respondents (58%) thought it was sufficient on the whole and others (25%) said it was sufficient about half of the time.

viii. Promotions

Almost all respondents view promotions by customers as a good thing that helps them to sell surplus products as long as their participation does not cost them. It was revealed that producers sell their products in plenty to their customers at a lower price. This is better than throwing away their products. The promotions helped to improve their business because they are assured of getting more orders and in acquiring new potential clients. Some respondents said promotion does not help local investors because they have inadequate market connections in Europe.

ix. Agreement of payment

The customers agree on the price during signing of the contract, the majority (80%) of respondents said most of their customers do not pay



premium. Some respondents said customers make payment late and the average delay is about two weeks to two months. To cope with this the producers use an overdraft.

x. Premium

It was revealed by the study that customers for Nduruma and Loliondo and Hortanzia farms, who have Fair Trade certification, get a premium to take into account price fluctuation. Other customers in the rest of the farms do not pay premium.

3.1.3 Delivery

According to respondents the actions taken by customers to shorten delivery times include; improving on logistics, quick order confirmation, sending orders much earlier, good planning and use of efficient air freight. Some respondents said they use negotiation, complaints and penalties.

As to how should this be done, the respondents suggested improved communication, better planning and part payment to be made in advance. Also suggested punctual air freight and in a short distances instead of a long distances. For example it was revealed that most of the products produced in Tanzania go through Kenyatta International Airport, which is more than 400 Kilometers. Improved airports in Arusha and Kilimanjaro could shorten the distances and reduce transport costs and at the same time shorten delivery time.

With regard to changes in lead times it was noted that 66% have not experienced changes in lead times for the last three years. Most of the producers were kept informed on the demand trends in order to react in a timely manner to customers' demands. The rest experienced changes in lead times over the past three years, for example Arusha Blooms was asked by customer not to send flowers because of global financial crisis. Respondents proposed to have a calendar of events for the whole year in advance to help the grower to prepare themselves and avoid last minute cancellation.



As to their ability to keep well informed about demand trends so as to react in a timely manner to customer's demands, it was revealed that all respondents were able to react and respondents said workers are always informed on the customer requirements and deliveries.

3.1.4 Payment to the customer

i. Payment of contribution

The majority (66%) of respondents revealed that their customers do not ask them to pay a contribution towards their profit based on sales volume. The rest indicated that their customers ask them to pay contribution towards overhead costs, for example; payment of auction commission and sometimes e-mail costs charged indirectly. These are calculated in percentages. This was viewed by respondents as unnecessary. The amount of commission contribution is in percentage, for some farms, for example; Kiliflair 1% is paid.

ii. Fines

About 50% of the respondents revealed that their customers fine them indirectly. This happens on failure to deliver in full after an order has been changed at short notice, late delivery and quality failure. Also the respondents said the fine is made indirectly by paying low prices, rejecting products if of poor quality and less delivery. Most of the respondents said the fines and contributions negatively affect their business. They said there is loss of projected income as a result failure to make payment effectively. For example; wages for their workers and other necessary administrative and production costs.

iii. Loyalty

Most of the respondents confirmed that they have never been asked to give loyalty and donations to their customers. Only 2 out of twelve respondents said have been asked to do so by their customers.



iv. Deductions from payments

Most of the respondents said no deductions are taken from their payment without agreements, except one respondent who said they do so. A respondent was quoted; “... they inform you through e-mail that they have deducted some money.... It is a complicated business”.

v. Maintaining Customers

Three respondents said they accepted to sell at a lower price than total production costs per unit to avoid losing their customers.

3.1.5 Quality

All respondents indicated that the quality specifications have increased in the past five years. About 75% of the respondents said the quality is reflected in the prices and others (25%) indicated that sometimes the price is lower. According to majority of respondents the actual costs of production has not increased except in two farms.

3.1.6 Price and cost of production

Majority (66%) of the respondents said their customers understand the full costs of production, while others (33%) indicated that their customers are not fully aware of the costs. Majority take measures to ensure that the price is compatible with labor standards and few of them do not take any measure. When calculating minimum selling price per unit the costs of labor including minimum wage and above, overtime premium in full compliance with labor laws, social benefits for workers and job training for workers is included by most of the farms, these items are regarded as production costs.

Three respondents said they do not consider social security benefits and on job training costs for workers because they were not able to do so. Some respondents said in the absence of better prices from global purchasing practitioners, there is nothing the management can do to raise workers' remuneration and other incentives or negotiate with TPAWU to improve the working conditions of the



workers much as they would like to. With the exception of one, all respondents indicated that health and safety training for workers, recruitment costs, and safety equipment costs are considered.

3.1.7 The impact of purchasing practices on WORKERS WAGES

Farm managers state that purchasing practice affects the ability of the producers to pay a living wage. The study noted that the producers pay legal minimum wage, however, even with negotiations of CBA all employers do not pay a living wage because most of them cannot afford to. Most of the respondent's especially normal workers complained of the low wages they get from their employers. Said... *"our main problem is low wage, the wage we get is not a living wage"*. Salary levels in the country within the agricultural sector are lower than is needed to sustain a living standard for the workers.

Most of the workers (rank and file workers) are paid as low as Tanzania Shillings 65,000 per month, this is not sufficient to meet the workers basic needs. A survey carried out by TUCTA (2006) estimated that on average living wage for a worker with an average family (?) need not to be less than Tanzania Shillings 315,000 per month. Respondents representing producers indicated that the business of the producers was not profitable enough and therefore cannot afford to pay better wages.

Table 4 Minimum monthly wage for workers and their concerns

	Company	Amount of wage paid	Comments and proposals of the respondents
1.	Q-SEM	73,000	--Production at the company is high but the wage is too low. The life costs are too big compared to wage paid.
2.	Moreman	65,000	--Wage paid is too low in relation to the costs of living. The minimum wage should be raised.
3.	Dekker breeding	67,500	--Wage is very little. It should be increased to a minimum of Tanzania Shillings 150,000
4.	Tanzania Flowers	65,000	--Government should raise the minimum wage which match with the costs of living
5.	Tanzania Flower C	67,000	--Wage increase from the current Tanzania Shillings 67,000 to 150,000



6.	Mount Meru Flowers	65,000	--Wage increase to at least Tanzania Shillings 100,000 --The wage should be paid according to the production capacity but should not be below statutory minimum wage.
7.	Kilihotex	65,000	--Wage to be increased to at least 100,000
8.	Damacena	65,000	--Increase wages
9.	Hortanzia	65,000	--The price of the products is high but the wage paid is too low. The employer should increase the wage
10.	Kiliflora Nduruma and Loliondo	65,000	--The wage is not enough
11.	Enza Zaden	85,000	--reposing an increase in wages because what is paid is not enough
12.	Multi-flower	78,000	--Increase the wage

Source: TPAWU Field Research 2009

Some ideas on what should be done by their customers to enhance their ability to comply with national law and codes of conduct in respect of the workers were as follows:

- Customers should add something on top of agreed price, (at least 2%) the amount shall be used to improve workers conditions on the farms (premium);
- Consumers to give more orders, increase the price of the products to enable producers pay a living wage to the workers;

3.2 External factors causing gendered occupational segregation within the cut flower industry

The basic purpose of undertaking a research into cultural behavior and managerial influences in gender biasness and discrimination in the workplace has been to make an assessment of external influences to the supply chain that are causing sexual division of labor, inability to manage domestic roles and workplace sexual harassment and gender power abuse.

Also, another purpose was to gain a better understanding and document why there is preference of women in the horticulture industry. This is based



on the evidences that in the horticulture sector women workers constitute the majority (over 60%) of the workforce. They are responsible for all kinds of tasks related to the production which demand reliable labor, precision and supervision.

Also the study aimed to evaluate current practices aimed at women's advancement on farms and assess their efficacy and to use this work to make recommendations that will influence the labor rights movement in their approach to gender equality.

The key questions were:

- What sort of cultural, behavioral and managerial prejudices do women encounter in the workplace and how does it affect their working life;
- The study further made an assessment on the roles of the women's structures (committees) on empowerment of women workers on farms;
- How does training in their rights empower them and what practical effects does this have;
- What obstacles exist to merit-based promotions?
- Policies related to workers rights, welfare, health and safety applied to companies and their relevancy to women workers, what are the benefits of those policies to women workers;
- Best techniques to empower women workers, overcome cultural prejudices and increase sympathy toward their needs.

3.2.1 Managerial prejudices women Encounter in the workplace

Why preferences of women?

The findings indicate that horticulture employers promote a stereotype that due to the size of their fingers women are able to handle flowers more carefully, and are better suited to work in horticulture than men. They also stated that women are more neat and careful than men.



It was further indicated that due to the height of their bodies and the slenderness of their physique, women can perform particular tasks much better, faster, more efficiently and cost-effectively than men in production of fresh vegetables, fruits and cut flowers.

Employers argue that they choose to employ women because they are physically more suited to the job. However this does not indicate skill, they maintain that the work is unskilled. Furthermore that the work is light and requires little energy, altogether this makes up the argument that the work should remain poorly paid compared to the work of men.

It was further revealed that majority of women from the nearby places apply for employment in the horticulture industry. The study also noted that due to limited employment opportunities especially for women majority of them apply for jobs in the horticulture farms.

Under the assumptions and realities described above, it was indicated by the respondents that women are preferred workers because they are 'obedient', 'careful', 'industrious', 'have little complaints' and are 'not aggressive' like men. Women are therefore seen as tolerant and more likely to put up with a poor quality working life. Also some respondents argued that women are weak in terms of competence and negotiation on their rights. Women are seen as being more docile and therefore may be less likely to stand up to employers who do not give them their rights. To some employers this is an advantage as the production costs remain lower. For example; if a number of women deserving maternity leave do not claim their rights the employer will not pay and this will add to profit.

Work done by women in the industry

According to the respondents the thinking of most of the people in Tanzania society is that the work and activities done by women are not demonstrated as tangibly as those of a man. A man's work is more formal and high ranking as compared to that of a woman.



The research revealed that within horticulture industry. The majority of the women are confined to lowly paid jobs. There are assignments or work which is only done or performed by women. Most of the work involves bending or long standing. The work include ;sowing, weeding taking excessive number of buds, harvesting of cut flowers, sorting, grading, batching, cleaning flower beds, collecting rubbish, watering flowers and sweeping, transplanting; castration; pollination, caring of green houses, propagation; nursery of vegetable and fruits; cutting and pinching. Also post harvest tasks such as sorting, cold room packing and some are engaged as supervisor.

The respondents argued that women workers are happy with the work because they are getting income to support their families and are getting out of poverty, however, they said the work is very tiring "..... you bend the whole day while sowing or weeding and at the end of the day you feel back ache..... sometimes you feel very tired due to long standing".

The respondents said according to culture and customs men cannot perform work which involves bending. The study reveals the differences between women and men sexes in occupation and this reflect gender inequality influenced by outmoded aspects of cultural heritage.

3.2.2 Obstacles to the promotion of women in the workplace

The study noted criteria used to appoint and promote workers in managerial positions; respondents gave different views with regard to the basis of promoting employees to supervisory or managerial positions which include:

- Working hard, being dedicated towards work and vigilance;
- Punctuality to duty stations;
- Reliable most of the time;
- Completion of tasks on time or good work performance;
- Obedience and faithfulness to orders and assigned duties;
- Ability to lead others; and
- Level of education especially in management, supervision and technical work and work experiences.



Data on the number of women in managerial positions indicated that majority of women occupy lower positions of supervisor. Higher positions in the management like Chief Executive Officer, Managing Director, Farm Managers, Human Resource Managers in the horticulture farms, are held by men. Specific managerial positions occupied by women workers are as indicated in table 4 below.

Table 5: Managerial positions by gender:

Position	Total	Males	Females
CEO	1	1	-
Directors	17	15	2
Heads of Departments	70	53	17
Managers	54	36	16
Supervisors	205	85	120

Source: Field Research 2009

The study revealed that more than 58% of supervisors are women, women are promoted to supervisory position; however, their decision making powers are limited. This means they cannot influence decisions which affect their lives. Important decision making positions are those of Human Resource Managers, Farm Manager. A good example of equal number of women and men in supervision positions was of Fides Tanzania Ltd, Q-sem, Kilihotex, and Dekker Bruins where 50% in that position is held by women.

The study revealed cases of good practices on women in decision making positions, out of 20 horticulture farms 36% of Managers are women. Half of the women managers were originally workers and promoted and the rest were recruited from outside the workforce. Some women and men workers have education to become managers and could be recruited.



Table 6: Women and men in managerial position

Farm	Males	Females	Total
1. Kiliflora Nduruma	7	2	9
2. Mt Meru Flowers	2	1	3
3. Q- SEM	4	1	5
4. Kiliflair	1	1	2
5. Dekker Moshi	2	4	6
6. Dolly	2	2	4
7. Dekker Kilimanjaro	3	1	4
Total	21	12	33

Source: Field research 2009

Criteria used by management

The criteria used by management to promote women workers are merit based but gender blind; they lack considerations of women’s reproductive and community roles which hinder their full engagement in economic activities. For example; due to reproductive roles women workers may not be as punctual as men, may not be able to complete their tasks as men. Also women workers may not be reliable at work as men due to family responsibilities. Management need to be more supportive of women’s child care needs and ensure that it is not a barrier to promotion. This means they may be discriminated against, unless specific gender provisions are made to promote/encourage women’s employment in higher managerial positions they will remain in lower positions.

Women’s practical needs

It was learnt, in some farms that although the women are preferred workers in practice their practical needs are not considered. The work processes and arrangements do not necessarily consider additional reproductive and domestic roles. Some respondents indicated that there are some farms which do not consider maternity protection for the reproductive mothers and this is a source of stress for the women workers.

The study noted that, before the year 2005 some working mothers lost



their jobs after their maternity leave and some went for maternity leave without pay. Other women were not allowed to go for breast feeding as the legislation provides. After awareness training for both workers and management the situation has changed, employers are complying with labor legislation and the women workers are claiming their rights.

According to the study women are getting promoted more to supervisory level but at a lower level to managerial positions. The reasons for this were due to low education and experiences.

Gender division of work in the horticulture industry

The study further noted that women do not engage in what is termed as “men’s work” mainly because of cultural reasons which puts gender division of labor and put different value between ‘women and men’s’ work. This defines ‘women’s and men’s’ work, they have been socialized to believe so and this affect them in practice. In some cases it is assumed that heavy work is supposed to be performed by men and women perform light work. For example; spraying, which is performed while a person is upright is done by men. It was noted that most of the “men’s Work” is better paid than “women’s work. It was noted by most respondents that sprayers in horticulture farms earn more than green house and pack house workers. For example sprayers at Kiliflora earn Tanzania Shillings 72,000 per month while workers in harvesting and packing and sorting (who are mostly women) earn Tanzania Shillings 67,000 per month.

Respondents in this study indicated that horticulture employers prefer women than men to certain jobs like sorting, grading, harvesting, and cleaning the green houses. These jobs are regarded as unskilled and hence paid less than other jobs mostly performed by men. It was also indicated that for cultural reasons, men would be unwilling to do this work. These jobs are viewed as unskilled and paid so much lower than ‘men’s work’.



Why women do not engage with “men’s work”

It was noted that as a result of socialization based on cultural attitudes women are not assigned ‘men’s work’ or women themselves do not go to what is viewed as ‘men’s work’. In most cases women apply for jobs which resemble activities performed at household level. For example women do not apply for construction of green houses, motor mechanics, spraying, truck driving instead they apply for work such as harvesting of cut flowers, sorting, grading, batching, cleaning flower beds, collecting rubbish, watering flowers and sweeping, transplanting; castration; pollination, caring of green houses, propagation; nursery of vegetable and fruits; cutting and pinching.

Respondents indicated that the jobs performed by women are regarded as unskilled because they are easily obtained without requirements of certificates for the work. Also said “women’s work just need few instructions and little time to catch up and do the work. Other explanations was that majority of women do not have skills for the work performed by men, for example driving, construction, mechanics, electrical work and other technical work.

Because of the wrong attitude on division of work women and men miss available employment opportunities. Women and men can perform any work available at the farm including those which are better paid. The cultural attitude needs to be challenged because it affects employment opportunities and imposes constraints on women’s ability to get higher paid jobs.

3.2.3 Efforts made to promote women workers rights

It is important to appreciate that the Tanzania government is committed to the eradication of all forms of discrimination against any person on grounds of gender as stipulated in Tanzania Constitution. The government has also ratified similar agreements on:

- Elimination of all forms of discrimination against women (CEDAW);



- The Beijing Platform for Action against Discrimination;
- The Gender and Development Declaration by Heads of State and Government of SADC;
- Prepared a National Gender Equality Policy.

At the national level, a lot has been done in gender equality in areas stipulated in international conventions, declarations and policies, where various enforcement and non-enforcement instruments and measures have laid down strategies for gender equality and mainstreaming.

Institutions such as trade unions in Tanzania have adopted the national policies on equality of opportunities between women and men and this is reflected in their specific constitutions and policies.

Efforts made by TPAWU to promote women workers

Trade unions represent and promote workers' rights in the labor market through collective bargaining agreements and social dialogue. Trade unions are concerned with gender equality issues in the world of work. The Trade Union Congress of Tanzania (TUCTA) has formulated a Gender Equality Policy, which has been adopted by affiliate unions including TPAWU. The policy provides guidance on equality and women workers rights issues.

The study revealed that TPAWU has made commitments to ensure gender equality and women workers rights. It has taken the following actions:

- The Constitution of TPAWU has mainstreamed gender issues; women are given equal opportunities in trade union leadership.
- Gender issues are incorporated into trade union structures with the aim of promoting the position of women in the workplaces and in the trade union. For example; the constitution has set aside positions for women in trade union leadership and women structures within the constitution;
- TPAWU also has prepared a Sexual Harassment Policy to guide on issues related to women's human rights abuses;



- TPAWU negotiated with 12 horticulture farms and concluded CBAs⁷, workers are enjoying the following benefits:
 - Reproductive mothers are getting their maternity rights and protections. For example; some farms allow breast feeding mothers to care for their babies during working hours for a period of 2 hours, 3 hours, and 6 hours for a period of a year. Also introduced breast feeding period for a period (12 farms) between 6 to 24 months;
 - In 12 farms employers agreed to provide maternity leave with full pay for 4 months;
 - Full pay when they attend Maternal and Child Health (12 farms) Clinics;
 - Special room for resting pregnant women have been allocated when they feel uncomfortable during working hours (4 farms)
 - Pregnant women are given light duties (12 farms);
 - Maternity leave increase to 90 days and after maternity leave workers retain their jobs (12 farms);
 - Period of breast feeding increased from two to four hours per day during working hours;
 - Pregnant mothers are assigned half tasks or light duties;
 - Protected from hazardous work environment.

3.2.4 Assessment on the Roles of Women Workers Committees (WWC)

3.2.4.1 Establishment of WWC

It was learnt that the women workers committees have played roles to the empowerment of the women workers. The formation of WWC is based on the Constitution of TPAWU and it is a positive step to ensure gender equality is attained and consolidated in the workplace. The Constitution provides for formation of WWC at branch, zone and national levels. TPAWU has formed 108 WWC at branch level, 8 zonal WWC and a National level WWC.

⁷ The farms with CBA are: Tanzania Flowers, Damacena, Dolly, Moaman, Dekker Kilimanjaro, Dekker Tanzania, Dekker Moshi, Dekker Breeding, Hortanzia, Mount Meru Flowers, Nduruma and Loliondo.



3.2.4.2 Importance of Women Workers Committees (WWC)

- According to respondents WWC are central in realization of women workers rights at the workplace;
- The committees are like bridges between WW and farms on the one hand, and women workers and their union (TPAWU) at all levels on the other.
- Through WWC, women workers are able to voice their needs and concerns to the relevant authorities for action.
- The committees have helped to strengthen solidarity among women workers.

3.2.4.3 Functions of the women workers committees

It was further learnt that WWC are aware of their roles and obligations to promote, defend and protect women workers rights. According to the respondents women's committees have played very important roles and have been leading channels through which WW issues are addressed. For example; cases of maternity rights, discrimination, reproductive roles working hours, health and safety issues and sexual harassment. Other functions of the women's committee include;

- Organize constitutional meetings to discuss and sort out needs of women workers and look for strategies to address them;
- Sensitize women and men workers to become members of TPAWU;
- Educate women workers on their rights and obligations at workplaces;
- Consult with management on gender equality issues and practical needs of women workers;
- Keeping relevant information on women workers;
- Emphasize management to make and enforce sexual harassment policy.

The study revealed that about 99 % of the Women Workers Committees in horticulture are active. It is only one branch which does not have a women workers committee. It was noted that the management are positive



and supportive on the functions of the committees. For example; the management allocates resources, including paid time for union activities during union training and meetings, transport, food and funds to cover some costs for union activities.

3.2.4.4 Issues and concerns addressed by Women Workers Committees

- Limited awareness on women workers rights hence lack of confidence to fight for them;
- Limited awareness on women workers rights including reproductive rights and protections;
- Inadequate / poor social services; for example child care facilities around the workplaces;
- Low income resulting into failure to meet basic needs;
- Inadequate structures and policies to address women workers rights;
- Sexual harassment at the workplaces.

3.2.4.5 How WWC have contributed to empowerment of women workers in horticulture farms

- Conduct constitutional meeting at workplace to discuss women workers issues;
- Presenting women workers problems to the union branch committees and management for action;
- Propose issues for CBA and defend those issues during negotiation;
- Fighting all violence against women including sexual harassment at the workplace;
- Collecting information concerning women's problems and use it for action;
- Encouraging women workers to contest for leadership positions.

3.2.4.6 Challenges facing WWC

- Traditions and culture which hinder women from participation in leadership;
- Low level of education and awareness among women workers and trade



union leaders on labor legislations and women workers rights;

- Limited resources both human, financial and time;
- Gender blind leadership at branch and union level;
- Limited capacity for negotiation;
- Sexual harassment at the workplaces.

3.2.4.7 Sexual Harassment at the Workplaces

The study has revealed that sexual harassment is a serious problem facing women workers in the horticulture industry. Other facts on sexual harassment were as follows;

- That although men may be victims of sexual harassment, the most vulnerable are women. The most frequently targeted victims are young women, widowed, or divorced women. Also women in lower wage categories, lower status of jobs or with precarious employment;
- It was learnt that sexual harassment conduct includes; unwelcome physical, verbal and non verbal conduct, or insulting statements. The respondents explained that sexual harassment is seen by the victims as a display of power which result into discrimination, intimidation, victimisation, coercion and degradation of women workers in having sexual knowledge with persons without their expressed consent;
- Respondents explained that women cannot control when, where, how or with whom they want to have sex with, to protect their health and their jobs;
- It was noted that some of the culprits are either supervisors or managers who force or induce women workers for sexual favors to guarantee maintaining their status and be able to continue working under less severe conditions and in nearby places from living quarters;
- It was further noted that the victims, majority women hesitate to report cases, complain or seek support due to fear of victimization including loss of their jobs. Some women 'give in' and end up unhappy and frustrated. It was noted that the women fear HIV/AIDS and unplanned pregnancies;
- Some effects of sexual harassment include; biased job evaluations,



poor personal recommendations, demotion, resignation, dismissal or transfer. Further effects are creating an intimidating hence unproductive environment and stress related illness;

- Respondents revealed that some women workers who are aware of their rights report to relevant authority for action. For example, at Kiliflora farm it was learnt that an average of 3 cases of sexual harassment per month on women workers are reported to the women workers committees, branch committees or management. It was also learnt that management and TPAWU branch took disciplinary actions against the perpetrators. The respondents said most of the workers are aware of sexual harassment and they are talking about it and expressing their concerns;
- The respondents indicated that some women workers committees, for example; at Nduruma and Arusha Blooms have taken positive actions against sexual harassment and the situation improved.

3.2.5 How training on workers rights empowered workers and practical effects

3.2.5.1 Awareness training

This was viewed by respondents as means for empowerment of workers to realize their rights. It was indicated that the training has benefited more women and this was reflected in one of the quotes by a workers' trainers as follows:

"Women have little opportunity in many organizations. Since females feel inferior compared to men then they need to be protected and empowered while at work and even be given priority in the employment process. In the agricultural sector the major part of workforce comprises of women. Thus for human resource managers in the agricultural sector need to take efforts to protect this disadvantaged group at workplace. This has to be done since most of this group has very low education⁸"

⁸ Stephen George in his paper presented during a Workshop for Human Resource Managers of the horticulture farms in Arusha. The workshop was organized under the project Developing Strategies for Change for Women in African Horticulture (Tanzania) June 2009)



3.2.5.2 Awareness training and benefits for workers

Awareness training has been a very important component for empowerment of the workers within TPAWU. The training activities for workers in horticulture farms were implemented since 2005 to 2009 through projects⁹ for “Promoting Women Workers Rights in African Horticulture” and “Developing Strategies for Change for Women in African Horticulture”.

Through the two project workers, trade union leaders, trained trainers and management were trained among other issues on; fundamental principles and rights at work, labor legislation, international codes of conduct, workers in the international supply chain, gender issues, occupational safety and health, trade unionism, women workers rights and HIV/AIDS and income support alternatives such as Savings and Credit Cooperative Society (SACCOS).

3.2.5.3 Enhanced awareness on Sexual harassment

Through focus group discussions it was revealed that:

- The training conducted by TPAWU through the project for Developing Strategies for Change for Women in African Horticulture, there is increased awareness among workers and management on sexual harassment. Both are positive tuned to address sexual harassment practices at the farms. For example three farms (Nduruma, Loliondo and Hortanzia) prepared policies on sexual harassment, which are in force. Other farms are ready to prepare a policy on sexual harassment;
- Women are reporting cases to the women workers committees at their workplaces for action;
- Cases of sexual harassment are decreasing in most farms and women feel more secure.

3.2.5.4 Best techniques to empower women workers

- Gender mainstreaming in trade union constitution and structures, programs and activities. For example formation of the women

⁹ The first three year Project 2005-2008 was funded through Women Working Worldwide (WWW) by FNV and the Second commenced in 2008-2011, funded by COMIC Relief.



workers committees, include women in decision making positions;

- Awareness raising for workers, management and the public on gender equality issues and the impact of gender dynamics and organizational culture that will help to change attitudes and practices among government officials, employers, trade unions and workers;
- Awareness training for management, women and men workers on negative effects of cultural practices which hinder women from accessing “men’s work.”
- Advocacy campaign to ensure gender equality and workers rights;
- Negotiate with employers to improve workers rights through collective bargaining agreements;
- Support workers and management to formulate sexual harassment policies at the workplace and create awareness through advocacy campaign to address the problem;
- Support women on family planning services at employer’s costs.

3.3 The effectiveness of social codes of practice primarily regarding gender issues

3.3.1 Implementation of the social code

Over the past three decades, as Western corporations grew both in size and influence over all aspects of the horticulture industry globally, there have been calls to act justly. One way to achieve this is through implementation of International code of conduct, which are voluntary agreements drawn up at company, industry or multi-sector levels to outline basic, social or ethical standards and protocols. The code contains basic human right in workplaces, based on the ILO Conventions. The Tanzania Government has ratified the ILO core conventions and domesticated them in the Labour Legislation.

Most horticulture farms in Tanzania abide by quality standards of the International Code of Conduct (ICC) requiring decent employment. The farms implementing the ICC are Kiliflora (Nduruma and Loliondo, Hortanzia



and Mount Meru Flowers. The farms are registered with Fair Trade Labeling Organizations (FLO). Only Kiliflora (Nduruma and Loliondo) is certified with Ethical Trading Initiative (ETI).

However, compliance differs from farm to farm. Four farms which abide by quality standards have fair trade certification and are better of on all ICC items except on living wage.

In 4 (20%) of the horticulture farms in Tanzania, women workers suffer from a wide range of sustained labor rights abuses, which constitute to violations of rights within national Labor Laws. Women workers also suffer economic exclusion, gender inequality, and cultural bias and social security inadequacies. These farms are not adhering fully to codes of conduct.

Goal of the research

The main goal of research under this sub-section was to understand the efficacy of the social codes of practice operating on the farms and to understand the perceived achievements of the same with regard to gender issues. Also to strengthen their ability to participate in dialogue regarding the codes at national and international levels and use the international codes of conduct and national law to improve women's position in the workplace.

Key questions and issues for the research were;

- What sort of code of conduct applied?
- How do the farms comply and benefit from compliance?
- How the trade union use the code to improve the working and living conditions of horticulture workers?
- How does workers benefit from compliance with Code of Conduct?
- How workers are involved in the auditing?
- Provision of personal protective equipment (PPE) and reported; cases of occupational health hazards.



3.3.2 Codes applied inn the horticulture farms

The study aimed to understand what kind of codes of conduct that the workers' companies comply with. Respondents listed the following codes of conduct:

- International Code of Conduct for the Production of Cut Flowers (ICC) and
- Ethical Trading Initiative (ETI Base Codes)¹⁰.
- MPS and FLO¹¹

The study concentrated on International Code of Conduct for the Production of Cut Flowers (ICC) The ICC is one of practical instrument for the improvement of the working and living conditions on the farms. The ICC has strong reference to ILO labor Standards and National Labor Legislation. The aim was to understand its effectiveness on workers.

3.3.2.1 Issues of interest in the ICC include:

- Freedom of Association;
- Collective Bargaining;
- Health and Safety;
- Equality of Treatment;
- Working Hours;
- Pesticides and Chemicals;
- Protection of the Environment;
- Security of Employment.

Table 7: Code compliance, certification and auditing.

	Farm	Type of code applied at the farm
1.	Nduruma and Loliondo	ICC, ETI, MPS, SEDEX, BOPP (
3.	Hortanzia	ICC, MPS
4.	Mount Meru Flowers	ICC, MPS

Source: TPAWU Field Research 2009

10

11 It is an international body incorporating various stakeholders; it sets standards and ensures the international regular auditing of producer and commercial partners.



The study revealed the efforts made by TPAWU on code compliance and, noted that 4 farms out of a sample study comply with most of ICC standards. The farms are certified and audited in order to monitor compliance. These are: Nduruma, Loliondo, Hortanzia and Mount Meru Flowers. The rest of farms, were not certified, audited but to some extent comply with some ICC standards. The farms includes; Tanzania Flowers A, Damacena, Mount Meru Flowers, Tanzania Flowers Dolly, Dekker Bruins, Dekker Breeding, Moaman, Dekker Bruins Kilimanjaro, Dekker Bruins Moshi, Enza Zaden, and Fides. As indicated earlier all farms under the study do not pay living wage, only pay statutory minimum wage, which is estimated at about 30%.

Some of the effort made by TPAWU is to raise awareness of the workers and management on the ICC standards and their importance and to include a clause in the CBA on code compliance. The section in the CBA on code compliance states as follows:

“International Code of Conduct: *The employer shall comply with International Code of Conduct (ICC) that governs cut -flower industries with respect to workers health, safety and the environment”*

However, the study revealed that all farms in a sample study did not comply fully with all items on the code. For example all farms did not pay a living wage, which means did not comply fully with ICC standards. The minimum wage paid by farms was estimated between 20% to 30%¹² only. Other code items not complied with in full include; health and safety, pesticides & chemicals and employment security, equality of treatment, freedom of association. The comparison on the level of code compliance in percentage between certified and uncertified farms were as indicated in table 6 below:

¹² Some farms paid higher than other farms but all range between 20 to 30% of the proposed TUCTA minimum wage.

**Table 8: Comparison on Code compliance between farms**

Code items	Certified with ICC	Not certified with ICC
<i>Freedom of association</i>	Kiliflora, Hortanzia, Mount Meru Flowers (100% membership)	Tanzania Flowers Ltd. Mount Meru Flowers, Tanzania Flowers Dolly, Dekker Bruins, Dekker Breeding, Fides Tanzania, Q-sem, Arusha Blooms, Dekker Bruins Kilimanjaro (75%)
<i>Collective Bargaining</i>	Kiliflora, Hortanzia, Mount Meru Flowers (100% farms with CBA)	Tanzania Flowers A, Damacena, Mount Meru Flowers, Tanzania Flowers Dolly, Dekker Bruins, Dekker Breeding, Moaman, Dekker Bruins Kilimanjaro, Dekker Bruins Moshi (100%) Proposal for CBA (Q-sem, Enza Zaden, Fides, Kilihotex, Korfovouni)
<i>Health and Safety</i>	Kiliflora (Nduruma, Loliondo), Hortanzia, Mount Meru Flowers (100%)	Tanzania Flowers A, Damacena, Mount Meru Flowers, Tanzania Flowers Dolly, Dekker Bruins, Dekker Breeding, Moaman, Dekker Bruins Kilimanjaro, Dekker Bruins Moshi, Enza Zaden, Fides (100%)
<i>4. Equality of treatment</i>	Kiliflora, Hortanzia, Mount Meru Flowers	Tanzania Flowers Ltd. Dolly, Dekker Bruins, Dekker Breeding, Fides Tanzania, Q-sem, Dekker Bruins Kilimanjaro (75%)
<i>Working hours</i>	Kiliflora, Hortanzia, Mount Meru Flowers (100%)	Tanzania Flowers Ltd. Mount Meru Flowers, Tanzania Flowers Dolly, Dekker Bruins, Dekker Breeding, Fides Tanzania, Q-sem, Arusha Blooms, Dekker Bruins Kilimanjaro (100%)
<i>Pesticides and chemicals</i>	Kiliflora (Nduruma, Hortanzia, Mount Meru Flowers (100%)	Tanzania Flowers Ltd., Tanzania Flowers Dolly, Dekker Bruins, Dekker Breeding, Fides Tanzania, Q-sem, Arusha Blooms, Dekker Bruins Kilimanjaro, Kilihotex (approximately 75%) Korfovouni (approximately 50%)
<i>Protection of environment</i>	Kiliflora, Hortanzia, Mount Meru Flowers, (100%)	Tanzania Flowers Ltd., Tanzania Flowers Dolly, Dekker Bruins, Dekker Breeding, Fides Tanzania, Q-sem, Arusha Blooms, Dekker Bruins Kilimanjaro (approximately 100%)
<i>Security of employment (employment contract)</i>	Kiliflora, Hortanzia, Mount Meru Flowers (100%)	Tanzania Flowers Ltd., Tanzania Flowers Dolly, Dekker Bruins, Dekker Breeding, Fides Tanzania, Q-sem, Arusha Blooms, Dekker Bruins Kilimanjaro (100%)
<i>Living wage</i>	Kiliflora, Hortanzia, Mount Meru Flowers (Approximately 30%)	Tanzania Flowers Ltd., Tanzania Flowers Dolly, Dekker Bruins, Dekker Breeding, Fides Tanzania, Q-sem, Arusha Blooms, Dekker Bruins Kilimanjaro (approximately 30%)

Source: Field Research 2009



GAPS in the ICC

According to the respondents the ICC lack considerations on gender issues. It was noted that the code items are too general to women and men. The code does not cover specific issues for the women workers, for example maternity protection, reproductive health issues for the women workers. It was learnt that about 60% of the workforce in the horticulture are women and most of them are in reproductive age. Bearing in mind their reproductive roles combined with employment situation in the cut flower industry which puts workers and particularly reproductive mothers at health risk they need to be protected.

Further more, it was noted that the code do not cover women workers rights and protection. In include; on reproductive health and protection from sexual harassment. Respondents suggested a review of ICC to make it gender sensitive and include women workers rights and protections. Also, suggested regular monitoring on reproductive health issues of the women workers to avoid possible health hazards.

It was also learnt that although farms are certified, they do not fully meet the required standards, for example, they were not paying a living wage. According to the estimated living wage, what was paid by the farms was about 30%.

3.3.3 How the farms comply and benefits from compliance

The study revealed that farms have benefited from code compliance. It was noted that they have benefited from freedom of association of the workers, collective bargaining agreements negotiated with the union, health and safety issues for workers, equality of treatment between women and men workers. Also benefits on compliance with working hours, pesticides and chemicals, protection of the environment and workers security of employment. Indicators on the on how farms have benefited are as shown in table 8 below:

**Table 9: Farm compliance and indicators**

Codes items	How the farm comply	Indicators of compliance
Freedom of Association	<p>Management allow and support freedom of association</p> <p>Management support union activities and provide resources (e.g. office premises (60%), transport (30%) and permission to attend trade union activities (100%).</p>	<p>---About 55% of the workers in horticulture farms are members of TPAWU.</p> <p>---Branch committees and women workers committees have been formed in about 99% of the horticulture farms and are active, branch committee constitutional meetings are held regularly during working hours. Workers issues are discussed during committee meetings and as a result the working environment is harmonious.</p>
Collective Bargaining Agreement	Farm management are ready to negotiate with the trade union to improve working and living conditions of the workers	12 out of 21 farms have negotiated with their employer for better terms and conditions of employment and have good Collective Bargaining Agreement (CBA). Negotiation for CBA is done easily and mutual agreement reached,
Equality of treatment	The management practice equality of treatment and no discrimination between women and men in employment in terms of payment of wages, promotions, training, and employment benefits	<p>---Pregnant women workers in 12 farms are given light work and resting rooms</p> <p>---Reproductive mothers retain their jobs after maternity leave</p> <p>---Women are promoted and enjoy equal employment benefits</p>
Working hours	It was revealed that employers adhere to requirements of the labour legislation	<p>Work legal hours not exceeding nine hours per day and 45 hours per week.</p> <p>Overtime is legal; 3 hours overtime per day and not exceeding 12 hours per week and working overtime is voluntary and correspond to statutory provisions.</p> <p>Payment of bonus is according to the agreement between the workers and employer.</p>



Health and safety and protection of the environment	Workers are protected from health hazards	<p>---Companies to provide a free and appropriate protective clothing and equipment (PPE) and comply with internationally recognized health and safety standards.</p> <p>---Company supply safe drinking water; provide clean toilets and offer shower and washing facilities.</p> <p>---Trained on health and safety and other work related issues.</p> <p>--- Also pregnant & nursing women workers are protected from hazardous conditions, the workers and their families undergo medical treatment and the safety committees have been formed.</p> <p>---Workers are trained on HIV/AIDS.</p>
Pesticides and chemicals	The management provide safety instructions to all workers	<p>--- Provide instructions on time to enter green houses after spraying is observed and sprayers are trained on pesticide handling and proper use of equipments.</p> <p>---There are checks and balances on the application of pesticides and chemicals through periodical inspections.</p>
Security of employment	90% of the respondents comply with labour legislation in relation to employment contract	<p>---It was noted that they engage workers on legal contracts, such as specified and unspecified contracts of employment.</p> <p>---The workers are given a copy of their employment contract in a language they understand.</p> <p>---Workers are informed by the management on production situation.</p>
Protection of the environment	Majority of the horticulture farms has programmes for environmental protection	<p>---The working environment in most farms is kept up to acceptable standards.</p> <p>---Most (80%) farms have programs for environmental protection and protection of the water sources and rivers passing across the farms are preserved.</p>

Source: Field Research 2009



The study revealed that there have been improvements on more farms that are covered by social codes of conduct. This shows that improvements on farms are not only a result of ICC but also to other factors, for example; the work of TPAWU including organizing and recruitment of workers, negotiation of CBA, awareness training of workers on work related issues.

3.3.4 How the trade union uses the code to improve the working and living conditions of horticulture workers

The study revealed that the trade union (TPAWU) used the ICC to improve the working conditions of the workers in the farms. The ICC provided bases for membership recruitment and collective bargaining agreements with farm employers, security of employment, improved health and safety, environmental protection, legal working hours and safe use of pesticides and chemicals.

The ICC compliance in the first 4 farms served as a good practice and TPAWU used the experience to negotiate on the same items with rest of the farms. The study noted various examples on how the codes have been used to improve the working and living conditions of the workers. Some examples on how TPAWU used the ICC to improve the conditions of the workers are as follows:

- **Collective Bargaining**

TPAWU use code item to negotiate with employers to improve working conditions of the workers. For example; 4 CBAs covering 12 horticulture farms have been negotiated. The CBA include a clause which reads as follows;

"The employer shall comply with the International Code of Conduct (ICC) that governs cut-flower industries with respect to workers health and safety of the environment".

- **Freedom of association**

TPAWU conducted awareness training on workers rights to freedom of association and as a result membership of TPAWU increased in all



farms from 25% in year 2004 to about 75% in year 2009. –

--Workers representatives are respected and supported by the employers in the performances of trade union functions, e.g. availing office accommodation, time and resources for trade union work. For example; 80% of the farm management provided office for TPAWU work.

- **Security of employment:**

The ICC states as follows: “Work which is by its nature not seasonal or temporary shall be done by workers on permanent contracts; every worker shall get a copy of their contract”. TPAWU negotiated with employers and conducted awareness training in employment standards and as a result Managements in 81% of the farms are providing legal contracts of employment with the exception of three farms of (Moaman and Korfovouni, Kiliflair, Kiliflair).

Equality of treatment:

The ICC provides that workers shall have access to jobs and training on equal terms, irrespective of gender. TPAWU negotiated with employers on equality of treatment between women and men and provisions states as follows:

“It is hereby agreed that no female employee will be subject to pregnancy tests as a precondition for recruitment.”

Working hours:

According to the codes of conduct working hours shall comply with applicable laws and industry standards. TPAWU conducted awareness training on working hours and negotiated with employers and included a clause in the CBA which states as follows;

“working hours for all permanent employees shall not exceed 40 hours per week should there be interruptions/un-notified/un-scheduled work permanent workers shall be paid full wages for the interrupted hours and the company will deploy them in other duties. Overtime for entitled



workers shall be those in excess of 40 hours in a working week. Overtime shall not exceed 12 hours per week. Workers shall have at least 24 hours consecutive hours of rest per week.

Wage

TPAWU negotiated with management of 12 farms and the minimum wage rose from Tanzania Shillings 65,000 to 85,000¹³ (30 to 40 GBP).

Pesticides and chemicals:

The ICC states that every company should assess the risks of the chemicals used and apply measures to prevent damage to their health. No banned, highly toxic (WHO) or carcinogenic pesticides and chemicals should be used. TPAWU conducted awareness training on pesticides and chemicals to workers and horticulture management and through negotiation of CBA and the provision in the agreement states as follows; "Employer shall adhere to rules and regulations governing the importation, registration, distribution and use of chemicals as set out by the Tropical Pesticide Research Institute, the World Health Organization (WHO) ...and shall hang a board outside the green houses and other places where pesticide spraying has taken place; these boards should indicate the names of the chemical, the time it was sprayed and the time where re-entry is permitted"

Protection of the environment:

The ICC states that Companies should make every effort to protect the environment and the residential areas, avoid pollution and implement sustainable use of natural resources (water, soil, air etc Based on this provision TPAWU negotiated and included a clause in the agreement which states as follows: "It is hereby agreed that the employer shall bear the responsibility of protecting the health of workers and that of the environment and shall ensure that waste water is treated or disposed in a way that does not endanger employees and the environment.

13

This is equivalent to US \$60 (March 2010)



3.3.5 How do workers benefit from compliance with provisions of the icc and efforts of tpaawu

The study revealed that as a result of compliance with provisions of the code complimented with TPAWU efforts to raise awareness of workers and particularly women workers on their rights regarding labor legislation, freedom of association and organizing, workers have benefited as follows:

- Workers are free to join the union, as a result TPAWU membership has increased from 3226 in 2005 to 4548 in 2009;
- Women workers are more organized and formed committees at branch, zone and national level. The committees are empowered on their rights;
- Employment of casual workers have been reduced, majority of beneficiaries are women; and majority especially women workers have employment security.
- The number of TPAWU branch committees increased and workers in 22 TPAWU workplaces enjoy their full benefits of freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining agreement.

Table 10: Progress made in terms of freedom of association and collective bargaining from 2005 to 2009

	YEAR	2005	2009
1.	Number of horticulture farms	17	22
2.	Branches OF TPAWU	13	22
3.	Women's Committee	6	19
4.	Membership of TPAWU	2737	4548
5.	CBA (number of farms covered)	3	12

Source: TPAWU field data 2009

The Case of Loliondo and Nduruma Farms

The two farms are members have fair trade certification and are benefiting from the premium for their workers. A Joint Body (JB), which represents over 1,000 workers, consists of both workers and management.

The union has spoken to workers and is satisfied that that the premium body is working without interference from management and to the



satisfaction of the workers. Some of the benefits gained by workers include; training women workers on leadership, which has resulted into increased confidence among and as a result there is improved confidence among them. Also improved transport facilities, awareness on health issues including HIV/AIDS and improvement of medical facilities. Other benefits for workers are protection of the environment.

3.3.6 Involvement of workers in auditing of implementation of ICC

3.3.6.1 Respondents outlined how the workers are involved in giving evidence as to how companies comply with and adhere to ICC:

- During the independent inspection a workers representative accompany inspectors/ auditors during inspection. Selected workers are interviewed one by one;
- Workers committee, women's committee and FLO Committee are interviewed;
- A workplace joint body (JB) committee is in place consisting of TPAWU Committee, Women's Committee and Health and Safety Committee). The JB committee is responsible for inspection of various issues including time to enter green houses and auditing of proper use of PPE.

3.3.6.2 Awareness training for workers and management

- The study revealed that they were trained on the contents of the codes and its relevance;
- They were made aware on their rights to freedom of association, collective bargaining, workers rights under labor legislation, health and safety;
- They were also sensitized on how to apply the code to improve the working conditions;
- TPAWU used the contents of the code during negotiation of the CBA. It was revealed by the study that as a result of awareness training on workers rights the working conditions of the workers have improved. This imply that social code and auditing are not the only factor influencing improvements in labor rights in Tanzanian horticulture but also the work of the trade union is a catalyst.



CHAPTER FOUR

4.0 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1 Purchasing practices of European Retailers and Impact on Workers

4.1.1 Conclusions

- The study has revealed linkages between purchasing practices and labor rights issues. Customers are not consistent in placing orders and this affects stability of the producers, they get give low price to producers and because of this the labor force is affected.
- Some customers cancel orders or place high orders with short turn around and to cope with this situation, the producers ask workers to work overtime;
- Some customers make late payment hence this puts the producer in difficult financial constraints; as a result there is a failure to meet necessary labor costs;
- The number of buyers differs from one farm to another; the majority of producers have long standing relationship with their customers. A significant number (40%) of respondents claimed that their customers are not consistent in placing orders and as a result this affects their stability and because of this they get low price and overgrowing of their products. The situation affects the labor force in terms of employment insecurity;
- Some producers do not have contracts with their customers. They indicated that their customers change volume and criteria of orders after placing them and also said the buyer lead times was not sufficient;
- Workers were asked to work overtime in some situations to meet high orders;
- Respondents said their customers decrease orders and as a result their products are damaged causing them to have cash flow problems



because they are faced to sell locally and at a very low price;

- Farm managements do not adequately comprehend what transpires in the markets, except that they give or send their produce to agents and wait for payments. The respondents were unable to explain what happened after they sent their products to the auction. Even when it is claimed that the UK retailers are transparent enough to monitor what happened at the auction as the decision making ladders are few, it is still not easy to verify in exact terms, the entire mechanisms of the global purchasing practices;
- Producers can hardly influence or negotiate decisions of the auctions as this is a typical buyer driven system which not only do the purchasing companies comply with consumer preferences but also consolidate more power to control producers and pressurize working patterns and processes at low prices;
- Under such global chains and channels, de-facto power to control production types and distribution patterns rests with the buyers rather than producers. Such power can be used, as it often does, to dictate exacting terms with respect to quality, price, processing and packaging and failure to strict adherence is penalized by paying low prices to products sold, threatening to the same effect, lowering profit margins of producers and causing them loss. Hence, the management need to offset perceived and actual losses due to unmet purchasing conditions;
- In such situations women workers find trapped in low grade jobs whose pay hardly meets the day's needs.

4.1.2 Recommendations

- Actions should be taken to regulate the purchasing practices to avoid unnecessary complications and ensure consistency of orders, contracts with customers with agreeable terms, stick to agreed volume or other criteria of orders, adequate notice period and sufficient lead time. Also, insist on compliance with legal overtime, avoid cancellation of orders, prompt payment, information about demand trends, avoid payment of



contribution, avoid fining producers, avoid deductions without agreement with producers and ensure producers sell at profitable prices;

- Ensure customers understand the full costs of production and include labor and social costs issues when calculating a minimum selling price per unit and transparency. Necessary actions should be taken at national, regional and international levels by human and labor rights advocates;
- Tanzania producers will have to reduce the delivery costs of its products in order to remain competitive. This will have to be accomplished through the adoption of new technologies for the industry aspects including; production, post-harvest handling, transportation, reduction of taxes, meeting the market's changing quality needs and increasing the number of industry participants;
- Advocacy actions at local and national and international level should be taken to ensure the buyer of products are aware of production costs, workers rights and the effects of the purchasing practices in general;
- Producers must have direct dealings with customers throughout in order to maximize company's income and ensure workers rights;
- Encourage local producers to produce products which are mostly consumed locally;
- Producers must be involved in making decisions in relation to the prices of their products.

4.2 Cultural, Behavioral and Management Influences

4.2.1 Conclusions

- Majority of horticulture workers are women, the preference is based on traditions and customs on gender division of labor in the households.
- Wrong assumptions, image, biases and perceptions on the role and responsibilities of women and men in society stem from culture and traditions which also have impact on socialization processes. As a result, the traditions and culture which are applied blindly, keeps them in inferior positions and affects them throughout their lives. Unfortunately, some of the cultural biases are unknowingly accepted by women and



applied blindly due to limited awareness among women and men on women's rights. The cultural practices have to be challenged.

- The study revealed that women face discrimination in respect of decision making positions merely because they are women;
- Sexual harassment is sex discrimination based on unwanted conduct of a sexual nature. Women suffer more because of societal attitudes towards women;
- Majority of women occupy lower decision making positions. The study revealed that only 25% of the horticulture farms have plans to promote gender equality policy at their workplaces. The rest of the farms did not have plans. After awareness training the management of the farms become positive on gender equality issues including promoting women into managerial positions;
- Generally, awareness training has contributed to the empowerment of the workers, there is noticeable behavioral and attitude changes compared to the period before. It was noted that before 2005 most of the women workers in the sector were ignorant of their rights and were not confident to make claims. After the training majority of women have developed self confidence and are able to make the right claims, for example; rights related to maternity protection;
- Women's committees at the workplace are playing an important role in addressing women's needs and concerns and fighting injustices against women. They are regarded as a bridge between women workers and the management and acts as a catalyst to equality of opportunity between women and men at the workplaces.

4.2.2 Recommendations

- Based on the findings of the study actions should be taken to ensure horticulture employers, workers both women and men are aware of the effects of culture on women workers. It is high time that the problem is addressed to ensure women workers are treated equally as men at the workplaces. The awareness will help to avoid prejudices and stereotype beliefs which undermine women workers;



- Women workers, trade unions and management of the farms should be empowered on equal opportunity issues and women workers on their rights through workplace policies and collective bargaining agreements;
- The trade union should strengthen its structure (workers committees and women's committee) and conduct the following:
 - In consultation with farm management develop a workplace policy on sexual harassment, which include complaint procedures that encourage the victim to take action against the harasser and establish counseling services;
 - Encourage the management to commit themselves to make a workplace free from sexual harassment and include sexual harassment in collective bargaining agenda and take actions against persons involved in the wrong doing;
 - Negotiate with employer to ensure the jobs to be offered to workers are be adequately remunerated with entitlement to full labor rights.
- Awareness training for management staff, women and men workers and on relevant legislations on women workers rights and protections, equal opportunity issues and negative effects of traditions and culture;
- Women should be empowered and promoted to take up traditionally male leadership and managerial positions;
- Advocacy and campaign actions at local and international level on women workers rights should be conducted;

4.3 Effectiveness of Social Code of Practice primarily regarding gender issues

4.3.1 Conclusions

- The ICC are useful to the workers in general and in particular to the women workers as it contribute to realization of their rights;
- The study noted some gaps in the code of conduct, which need to be filled to make them meaningful to the women workers, for example the code do not provide for maternity rights and reproductive health



and protections of the working female and male workers;

- The code of conduct do not provide for awareness training for workers and management. Training for workers on the contents of the codes of conduct is very important for effective implementation and in order to assess its usefulness. Awareness creation would help workers to demand for their basic rights pressurize the management to observe necessary standards
- Social auditing is not only the contributing factor to the improvement of the working conditions but also the work of TPAWU has contributed significantly to the betterment of the situation of the workers.
- The ICC does not adequately provide for maternity rights and reproductive health and protections of women workers. Also do not provide for protection on sexual harassment.

4.3.2 Recommendations

- Workers awareness training should be strengthened on labor standards and relevant code of conduct, as well as national labor legislation.
- The code should be revised to be gender sensitive, for example; to include reproductive health issues and should provide for regular monitoring of the reproductive health of women and men workers and should provide for sexual harassment;
- Advocacy actions at national and international level should be taken to ensure producers comply with national legislation, international labor standards and code of conduct.

Lastly, the above recommendations on purchasing practices of the European retailers and impact on workers, cultural, behavioral and management influences on women workers and social codes of practice primarily regarding gender should be addressed by the trade unions, government and non governmental organizations at local and international levels. The implementation of the proposed recommendations will contribute to empowerment and realization of women workers rights in African horticulture



REFERENCES

1. Rachel English: Promoting Women Workers' Rights in African Horticulture: An overview of research into conditions on horticulture farms in Kenya, Zambia, Tanzania and Uganda, 2007.
2. Alan, J.M., Ard, R. and Steven, J. (1998). *Profit from Petal. The Development of Cut-flower Exports in Southern Africa*; prepared for regional collaboration in southern Africa. A Research Report.
3. Mbwele, A.A. and Nzalawahe, M.E. (1999). *The Prospective Role of the Flower Sector in Tanzania's Economic Development*, background paper presented at the Government/ILO Workshop on the Community and Economic Impact of the Flower Industry in Tanzania, Mount Meru Hotel, Arusha, 23-24 Aug. 1999.



APPENDIX

Annex 1

Research issues/questions

1. *Purchasing Practices of European Retailers and Impact on Workers*

- Stability of relationship;
- Flexibility and seasonality;
- Delivery;
- Payment to the customers;
- Quality; and
- Price.

2. *Cultural behavioral and management influences on workers*

- Attitudes of management towards women workers and specifically reproductive mothers,
- Efforts made to empower women workers to address their needs and concerns.

3. *Social codes of practice*

- What sort of code of conduct applied?
- How does the farms comply and benefit from compliance?
- How the trade union use the code to improve the working and living conditions of horticulture workers?
- How does workers benefit from compliance with Code of Conduct?
- How workers are involved in the auditing?
- Provision of personal protective equipment (PPE) and reported; cases of occupational health hazards.

